

Steven M. Wilker, OSB No. 911882  
Email: steven.wilker@tonkon.com  
**Tonkon Torp LLP**  
1600 Pioneer Tower  
888 SW 5th Avenue  
Portland, OR 97204  
Tel.: (503) 802-2040; Fax: (503) 972-3740  
Cooperating Attorney for the ACLU Foundation of Oregon

Hina Shamsi (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: hshamsi@aclu.org  
**American Civil Liberties Union Foundation**  
125 Broad Street, 18th Floor  
New York, NY 10004  
Tel.: (212) 519-2500; Fax: (212) 549-2654

Kevin Díaz, OSB No. 970480  
Email: kdiaz@aclu-or.org  
**ACLU Foundation of Oregon**  
P.O. Box 40585  
Portland, OR 97240  
Tel.: (503) 227-6928; Fax: (503) 227-6948

Ahilan T. Arulanantham (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: aarulanantham@aclu-sc.org  
Jennifer Pasquarella (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: jpasquarella@aclu-sc.org  
**ACLU Foundation of Southern California**  
1313 West Eighth Street  
Los Angeles, CA 90017  
Tel.: (213) 977-9500; Fax: (213) 977-5297

Alan L. Schlosser (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: aschlosser@aclunc.org  
Julia Harumi Mass (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: jmass@aclunc.org  
**ACLU Foundation of Northern California**  
39 Drumm Street  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Tel.: (415) 621-2493; Fax: (415) 255-8437

Laura Schauer Ives (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: lives@aclu-nm.org  
**ACLU Foundation of New Mexico**  
P.O. Box 566  
Albuquerque, NM 87103

Tel.: (505) 243-0046; Fax: (505) 266-5916

Mitchell P. Hurley (Admitted *pro hac vice*)

Email: [mhurley@akingump.com](mailto:mhurley@akingump.com)

Christopher M. Egleson (Admitted *pro hac vice*)

Email: [cegleson@akingump.com](mailto:cegleson@akingump.com)

Justin H. Bell (Admitted *pro hac vice*)

Email: [bellj@akingump.com](mailto:bellj@akingump.com)

**Akin Gump Strauss Hauer & Feld LLP**

One Bryant Park

New York, NY 10036

Tel.: (212) 872-1011; Fax: (212) 872-1002

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF OREGON  
PORTLAND DIVISION**

Ayman Latif, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Eric H. Holder, Jr., et al.,

Defendants.

No. 3:10-cv-750-BR

**PLAINTIFFS' NOTICE OF SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY**

As supplemental authority in support of their Cross-Motion for Partial Summary Judgment, Plaintiffs respectfully submit the Public Notice and Summary of Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law After Bench Trial ("Public Notice"), attached as Exhibit A and issued on January 14, 2014 in *Rahinah Ibrahim v. Department of Homeland Security, et al.*, No. C06-00545-WHA (N.D. Cal.).

The Public Notice summarizes a provisionally-sealed order granting relief to a nonimmigrant alien plaintiff who was placed on the No Fly List and denied boarding on a plane, which, the court held, constituted "concrete, reviewable adverse government action." Public Notice at 1–2. The court afforded the plaintiff an opportunity to show that the government's action "resulted from an error," and concluded that the plaintiff had made that showing. *Id.* at 2. The court further concluded that (1) due process mandates that the government "cleanse and/or correct its lists and records" of mistaken information and "certify under oath that such correction(s) have been made," and (2) administrative remedies afforded by the government "fall

short of such relief and do not supply sufficient due process.” *Id.* Finally, the court ordered the government to disclose to the plaintiff her status on, or off, the No Fly List. *Id.*

In sum, the district court’s decision in *Ibrahim* is grounded in due process concerns—the basis for Plaintiffs’ constitutional challenge in this matter—and appears to grant relief similar to the relief Plaintiffs seek from this Court.

Dated: January 15, 2014

Respectfully submitted,

Steven M. Wilker, OSB No. 911882  
Email: steven.wilker@tonkon.com  
**Tonkon Torp LLP**  
1600 Pioneer Tower  
888 SW 5th Avenue  
Portland, OR 97204  
Tel.: (503) 802-2040; Fax: (503) 972-3740  
Cooperating Attorney for the ACLU  
Foundation of Oregon

s/ Hina Shamsi

Hina Shamsi (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: hshamsi@aclu.org  
**American Civil Liberties Union  
Foundation**  
125 Broad Street, 18th Floor  
New York, NY 10004  
Tel.: (212) 519-2500; Fax: (212) 549-2654

Kevin Díaz, OSB No. 970480  
Email: kdiaz@aclu-or.org  
**ACLU Foundation of Oregon**  
P.O. Box 40585  
Portland, OR 97240  
Tel.: (503) 227-6928; Fax: (503) 227-6948

Ahilan T. Arulanantham (Admitted *pro hac  
vice*)  
Email: aarulanantham@aclu-sc.org  
Jennifer Pasquarella (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: jpasquarella@aclu-sc.org  
**ACLU Foundation of Southern California**  
1313 West Eighth Street  
Los Angeles, CA 90017

Tel.: (213) 977-9500; Fax: (213) 977-5297

Alan L. Schlosser (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: aschlosser@aclunc.org

Julia Harumi Mass (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: jmass@aclunc.org

**ACLU Foundation of Northern  
California**

39 Drumm Street  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Tel.: (415) 621-2493; Fax: (415) 255-8437

Laura Schauer Ives (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: lives@aclu-nm.org

**ACLU Foundation of New Mexico**

P.O. Box 566  
Albuquerque, NM 87103  
Tel.: (505) 243-0046; Fax: (505) 266-5916

Mitchell P. Hurley (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: mhurley@akingump.com

Christopher M. Egleson (Admitted *pro hac  
vice*)

Email: cegleson@akingump.com  
Justin H. Bell (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: bellj@akingump.com

**Akin Gump Strauss Hauer & Feld LLP**

One Bryant Park  
New York, NY 10036  
Tel.: (212) 872-1011; Fax: (212) 872-1002

Attorneys for Plaintiffs